

# Dioxins and related compounds in human breast milk collected around open dumping sites in Asian developing countries: Bovine milk as a potential source

Kunisue T., Watanabe M., Iwata H., Subramanian A., Monirith I., Minh T.B., Baburajendran R., Tana T.S., Viet P.H., Prudente M., Tanabe S.

Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan; Ctr. of Adv. Study in Marine Biology, Annamalai University, Tamil Nadu, India; Social and Culture Observation Unit, Cabinet of the Council of Minister, Cambodia; Ctr. Environ. Tech./Sustainable D., Hanoi National University, Hanoi, Viet Nam; Science Education Department, De La Salle University, Manila, Philippines

**Abstract:** In this study, concentrations of dioxins and related compounds (DRCs)-such as polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins, polychlorinated dibenzofurans, and coplanar polychlorinated biphenyls-were found in human breast milk from women living near dumping sites of municipal waste and reference sites in India, Cambodia, Vietnam, and the Philippines during 1999 to 2000. DRCs were detected in all human breast milk samples analyzed, demonstrating that residents in these Asian developing countries have been exposed to these contaminants. In India, the concentrations of DRCs in human breast milk from women living near the investigated dumping site were notably higher than those from women living near reference sites and from women in other Asian developing countries. Toxic equivalent quantity (TEQ) levels of DRCs were comparable with or higher than those reported in the general populations of developed countries since 1990. In contrast, levels of these contaminants in human breast milk in women from Cambodia and Vietnam were not significantly different between milk from women living near the dumping and reference sites. These results indicate that significant pollution sources for DRCs are present in Indian dumping sites and that residents there have been exposed to relatively higher levels of these contaminants. TEQ levels in human breast milk from the dumping site in India tended to decrease with an increase in the number of previous deliveries by mothers, whereas no significant relationship was observed in Cambodia, Vietnam, or the Philippines. This suggests that mothers who have been exposed to relatively high levels of DRCs transfer greater amounts of these contaminants to the first infant than later ones through breast-feeding, which in turn implies that the first children of these mothers might be at higher risk from DRCs. When the residue levels of DRCs in bovine milk collected from the Indian dumping site and reference sites were examined, TEQ levels in bovine milk from the dumping site were higher than those from reference sites. This result suggests that bovine milk is a potential source of DRCs for residents living near the dumping site in India. To our knowledge, this is the first comprehensive study on exposure to DRCs of residents living in proximity to open dumping sites of municipal waste in Asian developing countries.

**Index Keywords:** dioxin; polychlorinated biphenyl derivative; polychlorinated dibenzodioxin; polychlorinated dibenzofuran; bioaccumulation; dioxin; milk; PCDD; pollution exposure; waste facility; adult; article; breast milk; controlled study; dumping; environmental exposure; female; human; major clinical study; municipal solid waste; priority journal; toxicokinetics; Adolescent; Adult; Animals; Asia; Data Collection; Developing Countries; Dioxins; Environmental Exposure; Environmental Monitoring; Female; Food Contamination; Humans; Middle Aged; Milk; Milk, Human; Parity; Pregnancy; Refuse

Disposal; Risk Factors; Asia; Eurasia; Bovinae

Year: 2004

Source title: Archives of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology

Volume: 47

Issue: 3

Page : 414-426

Cited by: 21

Link: [Scopus Link](#)

Chemicals/CAS: Dioxins

Correspondence Address: Tanabe, S.; Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan; email: [shinsuke@agr.ehime-u.ac.jp](mailto:shinsuke@agr.ehime-u.ac.jp)

ISSN: 904341

CODEN: AECTC

DOI: 10.1007/s00244-004-3172-4

PubMed ID: 15386136

Language of Original Document: English

Abbreviated Source Title: Archives of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology

Document Type: Article

Source: Scopus

Authors with affiliations:

- Kunisue, T., Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan
- Watanabe, M., Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan
- Iwata, H., Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan
- Subramanian, A., Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan, Ctr. of Adv. Study in Marine Biology, Annamalai University, Tamil Nadu, India
- Monirith, I., Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan
- Minh, T.B., Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan
- Baburajendran, R., Ctr. of Adv. Study in Marine Biology, Annamalai University, Tamil Nadu, India
- Tana, T.S., Social and Culture Observation Unit, Cabinet of the Council of Minister, Cambodia
- Viet, P.H., Ctr. Environ. Tech./Sustainable D., Hanoi National University, Hanoi, Viet Nam
- Prudente, M., Science Education Department, De La Salle University, Manila, Philippines
- Tanabe, S., Ctr. for Mar. Environmental Studies, Ehime University, Bunkyo-cho 2-5, Matuyama 790-8577, Japan

References:

- Alcock, R.E., Jones, K.C., Dioxins in the environment: A review of trend data (1996) *Environ Sci Technol*, 30, pp. 3133-3143
- Alcock, R.E., Sweetman, A.J., Anderson, D.R., Fisher, R., Jennings, R.A., Jones, K.C., Using PCDD/F congener patterns to determine the source of elevated TEQ concentrations in cows milk: A case study (2002) *Chemosphere*, 46, pp. 383-391
- Bates, M.N., Hannah, D.J., Buckland, S.J., Taucher, J.A., Van Maanen, T., Chlorinated organic contaminants in breast milk of New Zealand woman (1994) *Environ Health Perspect*, 102 (SUPPL. 1), pp. 211-217
- Becher, G., Skaare, J.U., Polder, A., Sletten, B., Rossland, O.J., Hansen, H.K., PCDDs, PCDFs, and PCBs in human milk from different parts of Norway and Lithuania (1995) *J Toxicol Environ Health*, 46, pp. 133-148

- Beck, H., Dross, A., Mathar, W., PCDD and PCDF exposure and levels in humans in Germany (1994) *Environ Health Perspect*, 102 (SUPPL. 1), pp. 187-193
- Bradley, D., Stamping out dioxin in food? (2000) *Environ Sci Technol*, 34, pp. 504A
- Carpenter, D.O., Chew, F.T., Damstra, T., Lam, L.H., Landrigan, P.J., Makalinao, I., Environmental threats to the health of children: The Asian perspective (2000) *Environ Health Perspect*, 108, pp. 989-992
- Cole, D.C., Kearney, J., Ryan, J.J., Gilman, A.P., Plasma levels and profiles of dioxin and dioxin-like compounds in Ontario Great Lakes anglers (1999) *Chemosphere*, 34, pp. 1401-1409
- Dahl, P., Lindstrom, G., Wiberg, K., Rappe, C., Absorption of polychlorinated biphenyls, dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans by breast-fed infants (1995) *Chemosphere*, 30, pp. 2297-2306
- Dewailly, E., Nantel, A., Bruneau, S., Laliberte, C., Ferron, L., Gingras, S., Breast milk contamination by PCDDs, PCDFs and PCBs in arctic Quebec: A preliminary assessment (1992) *Chemosphere*, 25, pp. 1245-1249
- Domingo, J.L., Schuhmacher, M., Granero, S., Llobet, J.M., PCDDs and PCDFs in food samples from Catalonia, Spain. An assessment of dietary intake (1999) *Chemosphere*, 38, pp. 3517-3528
- Fiedler, H., Cooper, K.R., Bergek, S., Hjelt, M., Rappe, C., Polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and polychlorinated dibenzofurans (PCDD/PCDF) in food samples collected in southern Mississippi, USA (1997) *Chemosphere*, 34, pp. 1411-1419
- Fries, G.F., Paustenbach, D.J., Luksemburg, W.J., Complete mass balance of dietary polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans in dairy cattle and characterization of the apparent synthesis of hepta- and octachlorodioxins (2002) *J Agric Food Chem*, 50, pp. 4226-4231
- Fries, G.F., Paustenbach, D.J., Mather, D.B., Luksemburg, W.J., A congener specific evaluation of transfer of chlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans to milk of cows following ingestion of pentachlorophenol-treated wood (1999) *Environ Sci Technol*, 33, pp. 1165-1170
- Fürst, P., Fürst, C., Wilmers, K., Human milk as a bioindicator for body burden of PCDDs, PCDFs, organochlorine pesticides, and PCBs (1994) *Environ Health Perspect*, 102 (SUPPL. 1), pp. 187-193
- Goldman, L.R., Harnly, M., Flattery, J., Patterson Jr., D.G., Needham, L.L., Serum polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and polychlorinated dibenzofurans among people eating contaminated home-produced eggs and beef (2000) *Environ Health Perspect*, 108, pp. 13-19
- Gonzalez, M.J., Jimenez, B., Hernandez, L.M., Gonnord, M.F., Levels of PCDDs and PCDFs in human milk from populations in Madrid and Paris (1996) *Bull Environ Contam Toxicol*, 56, pp. 197-204
- Hirai, T., Fujimine, Y., Kodaira, T., Watanabe, S., Simple solid-phase lipid extraction of dioxins from maternal breast milk (2001) *Organohalogen Compd*, 50, pp. 138-141
- Hooper, K., Chuvakova, T., Kazbekova, G., Hayward, D., Tulenova, A., Petreas, M.X., Analysis of breast milk to assess exposure to chlorinated contaminants in Kazakhstan: Sources of 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (TCDD) exposures in an agricultural region of southern Kazakhstan (1999) *Environ Health Perspect*, 107, pp. 447-457
- Hooper, K., Petreas, M.X., She, J., Visita, P., Winkler, J., McKinney, M., Analysis of breast milk to assess exposure to chlorinated contaminants in Kazakstan: PCBs and organochlorine pesticides in southern Kazakstan (1997) *Environ Health Perspect*, 105, pp. 1250-1254
- Iida, T., Hirakawa, H., Matsueda, T., Takenaka, S., Nagayama, J., Polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and related compounds in breast milk of Japanese primiparas and multiparas (1999) *Chemosphere*, 38, pp. 2461-2466
- Johansen, H.R., Alexander, J., Rosslund, O.J., Planting, S., Lovik, M., Gaarder, P.I., PCDDs, PCDFs, and PCBs in human blood in relation to consumption of crabs from a contaminated fjord area in Norway (1996) *Environ Health Perspect*, 104, pp. 756-764
- John, P.J., Bakore, N., Bhatnager, P., Assessment of organochlorine pesticide residue levels in dairy milk and buffalo milk from

- Jaipur city, Rajasthan, India (2001) *Environ Int*, 26, pp. 231-236
- Kannan, K., Tanabe, S., Quynh, H.T., Hue, N.D., Tatsukawa, R., Residue pattern and dietary intake of persistent organochlorines in foodstuffs from Vietnam (1992) *Arch Environ Contam Toxicol*, 22, pp. 367-374
  - Kannan, K., Tanabe, S., Ramesh, A., Subramanian, A.N., Tatsukawa, R., Persistent organochlorine residues in foodstuffs from India and their implications on human dietary exposure (1992) *J Agric Food Chem*, 40, pp. 518-524
  - Kiviranta, H., Purkunen, R., Vartiainen, T., Levels and trends of PCDD/Fs and PCBs in human milk in Finland (1999) *Chemosphere*, 38, pp. 311-323
  - Koopman-Esseboom, C., Morse, D.C., Weisglas-Kuperus, N., Lutkeschipholt, I.J., Van Der Paauw, C.G., Tuinstra, L.G.M.T., Effects of dioxins and polychlorinated biphenyls on thyroid hormone status of pregnant women and their infants (1994) *Pediatr Res*, 36, pp. 468-4473
  - Koppe, J.G., Nutrition and breast-feeding (1995) *Eur J Obstet Gynecol Reprod Biol*, 61, pp. 73-78
  - Korner, W., Dawidowsky, N., Hagenmaier, H., Fecal excretion rates of PCDDs and PCDFs in two breast-fed infants (1993) *Chemosphere*, 27, pp. 157-162
  - LaKind, J.S., Berlin, C.M., Naiman, D.Q., Infant exposure to chemicals in breast milk in the United States: What we need to learn from a breast milk monitoring program (2001) *Environ Health Perspect*, 109, pp. 75-88
  - Liem, A.K.D., Albers, J.M.C., Baumann, R.A., Van Beuzekom, A.C., Den Hartog, R.S., Hoogerbrugge, R., PCBs, PCDDs, PCDFs and organochlorine pesticides in human milk in the Netherlands. Levels and trends (1995) *Organohalogen Compd*, 26, pp. 69-74
  - McLachlan, M.S., Digestive tract absorption of polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins, dibenzofurans, and biphenyls in a nursing infant (1993) *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol*, 123, pp. 68-72
  - Minh, N.H., Minh, T.B., Watanabe, M., Kunisue, T., Monirith, I., Tanabe, S., Open dumping site in Asian developing countries: A potential source of polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and polychlorinated dibenzofurans (2003) *Environ Sci Technol*, 37, pp. 1493-1501
  - (1999), [http://www1.mhlw.go.jp/houdou/1108/h0802-1\\_18.html](http://www1.mhlw.go.jp/houdou/1108/h0802-1_18.html) Nagayama, J., Okamura, K., Iida, T., Hirakawa, H., Matsueda, T., Tsuji, H., Postnatal exposure to chlorinated dioxins and related chemicals on thyroid hormone status in Japanese breast-fed infants (1998) *Chemosphere*, 37, pp. 1789-1793
  - Nagayama, J., Tsuji, H., Iida, T., Hirakawa, H., Matsueda, T., Okamura, K., Postnatal exposure to chlorinated dioxins and related chemicals on lymphocyte subsets in Japanese breast-fed infants (1998) *Chemosphere*, 37, pp. 1781-1787
  - Norén, K., Meironyté, D., Certain organochlorine and organobromine contaminants in Swedish human milk in perspective of past 20-30 years (2000) *Chemosphere*, 40, pp. 1111-1123
  - Paumgartten, F.J.R., Cruz, C.M., Chahoud, I., Palavinskas, R., Mathar, W., PCDDs, PCDFs, PCB, and other organochlorine compounds in human milk from Rio de Janeiro, Brazil (2000) *Environ Res*, 83, pp. 293-297
  - Pluim, H.J., Wever, J., Koppe, J.G., Slikkevd, J.W., Olie, K., Intake and faecal excretion of chlorinated dioxins and dibenzofurans in breast-fed infants at different ages (1993) *Chemosphere*, 26, pp. 1947-1952
  - Porterfield, S.P., Vulnerability of the developing brain to thyroid abnormalities: Environmental insults to the thyroid system (1994) *Environ Health Perspect*, 102 (SUPPL. 2), pp. 962-966
  - Sakai, S., Hatakawa, K., Takatsuki, H., Kawakami, I., Dioxin-like PCBs released from waste incineration and their deposition flux (2001) *Environ Sci Technol*, 35, pp. 3601-3607
  - Schecter, A., Fürst, P., Fürst, C., Groebel, W., Kolesnikov, S., Savchenkov, M., Levels of dioxins, dibenzofurans and other chlorinated xenobiotics in human milk from the Soviet Union (1990) *Chemosphere*, 20, pp. 927-934
  - Schecter, A., Startin, J.R., Rose, M., Wright, C., Parker, I., Woods, D., Chlorinated dioxin and dibenzofuran levels in human

- milk from Africa, Pakistan, southern Vietnam, the southern U.S. and England (1990) *Chemosphere*, 20, pp. 919-925
- Schecter, A., Jiang, K., Röpke, O., Fürst, P., Fürst, P., Fürst, C., Comparison of dibenzodioxin levels in blood and milk in agricultural workers and others following pentachlorophenol exposure in China (1994) *Chemosphere*, 29, pp. 2371-2380
  - Schecter, A., Ryan, J.J., Röpke, O., Decrease in levels and body burden of dioxins, dibenzofurans, PCBs, DDE, and HCB in blood and milk in a mother nursing twins over a thirty-eight month period (1998) *Chemosphere*, 37, pp. 1807-1816
  - Schuhmacher, M., Domingo, J.L., Llobet, J.M., Kiviranta, H., Vartiainen, T., PCDD/F concentrations in milk of nonoccupationally exposed women living in southern Catalonia, Spain (1999) *Chemosphere*, 38, pp. 995-1004
  - Schulz, D.E., Petrick, G., Duinker, J.C., Complete characterization of polychlorinated biphenyl congeners in commercial aroclor and clophen mixtures by multidimensional gas chromatography-Electron capture detection (1989) *Environ Sci Technol*, 23, pp. 852-859
  - Takasuga, T., Inoue, T., Ohi, E., All congener specific analytical method for polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) with various chromatographic clean-up and HRGC/HRMS (1995) *J Environ Chem*, 5, pp. 647-675
  - Thomas, G.O., Jones, J.L., Jones, K.C., Polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxin and furan (PCDD/F) uptake by pasture (2002) *Environ Sci Technol*, 36, pp. 2372-2378
  - Travis, C.C., Hattmer-Frey, H.A., Human exposure to dioxin (1991) *Sci Total Environ*, 104, pp. 97-127
  - Uauy, R., Peirano, P., Breast is best: Human milk is the optimal food for brain development (1999) *Am J Clin Nutr*, 70, pp. 433-434
  - Van Den Berg, M., Brinbaum, L., Bosveld, A.T.C., Brunstrom, B., Cook, P., Feeley, M., Toxic equivalency factor (TEFs) for PCBs, PCDDs, PCDFs for humans and wildlife (1998) *Environ Health Perspect*, 106, pp. 775-792
  - Van Leeuwen, F.X.R., Feeley, M., Schrenk, D., Larsen, J.C., Farland, W., Younes, M., Dioxins: WHO's tolerable daily intake (TDI) revisited (2000) *Chemosphere*, 40, pp. 1095-1101
  - Weisglas-Kuperus, N., Sas, T.C.J., Koopman-Esseboom, C., Van Der Zwan, C.W., De Ridder, M.A.J., Beishuizen, A., Immunologic effects of background prenatal and postnatal exposure to dioxins and polychlorinated biphenyls in Dutch infants (1995) *Pediatr Res*, 38, pp. 404-410
  - Weisglas-Kuperus, N., Patandin, S., Berbers, G.A.M., Sas, T.C.J., Mulder, P.G.H., Sauer, P.J.J., Immunologic effects of background exposure to polychlorinated biphenyls and dioxins in Dutch preschool children (2000) *Environ Health Perspect*, 108, pp. 1203-1207